

begins hundreds of miles above that. I have more than once embarked at Stretensk in a tug steamer, gone all the way down the great river to its mouth, a journey of just 2000 miles. For quite half the distance the Amur forms the boundary of the Russian and Chinese Empires. But distance does not always depend upon the mere physical fact. In some respects I found that it was not such a very far cry from Amur to, say, an English village; that, owing to the conditions of the hinterland on both sides, the banks of the Amur constituted, in fact, one large village, where at any particular point one heard gossip going on much as in a village in England. If a marriage, a birth, a scandal of any sort took place, say at Nicolaievsk, the next steamer brought the news to Khabarovsk; five days later it was the talk of Blagovyeshchensk; and so on, the whole of the news floating up and down the river just as though it were the street of one little village. I was at Blagovyeshchensk at the time of the massacre, and was told, truly enough, that to cross to the Chinese side was to have my throat cut. The same story was repeated on other occasions, but in 1910 I determined to take what risk there was and go. I got a Chinaman who had driven cattle from Mongolia and knew some Russian, to act as interpreter, and a Russian who owned a cart and three horses to drive me; nobody attempted to cut my throat, and after a pleasant journey of eight days I reached the Manchurian railway at Tsitsihar. I was the first Western European to cover that route, but I found that the first person of note to travel over any part of it was one whose name will always be heard with respect at any meeting of this Society. I refer to Prince Kropotkin, who made an expedition there and published a paper on it as far back as in 1864. He was followed by one or two Russian scientists and military surveyors, but by no one from further west. I gather from the lecturer that even now there is no railway in these parts, although before the war one was projected, so that communication is still by road only. I do not think I need add anything more. As Sir Francis Younghusband has said, this lecture has filled my memory with all sorts of things, and it would be easy to go on, but I will end now by thanking the lecturer very much for one of the most admirable lectures, and one of the most beautifully illustrated, I have ever heard.

The PRESIDENT: It is just possible that in the audience there may be some lady or gentleman who has some knowledge of that part of the world. If so, we would be glad if they would kindly say a few words. If not, there is nothing further for me to do than to ask you to join in a very cordial vote of thanks to Captain Sowerby for a most interesting and admirable lecture, one of the best we have heard in this room this season.

MARCO POLO'S ACCOUNT OF A MONGOL INROAD INTO KASHMIR

Sir Aurel Stein, K.C.I.E.

IT has been my good fortune in the course of three Central Asian journeys to see and in most parts to survey the routes which Marco Polo had followed from the great bend of the Oxus right through to the "Great Province of Tangut" or Kan-su in westernmost China. In my 'Ancient Khotan,' recording the scientific results of my first journey, and

again in 'Desert Cathay,' the personal narrative of the second, I have had occasion to bear testimony to the accuracy of all data which the great Venetian has left us of what he himself observed on his way up the Oxus, across the Pamirs, and thence through the deserts and oases of the Tarim Basin to the western borderlands of Cathay. In *Serindia*, the detailed report on the explorations of my second expedition, which the end of the war will now, I hope, permit to issue before long from the Oxford University Press, opportunity offered to examine also some notes of Marco Polo bearing on regions adjacent to his route but not actually visited by him. Among these the Hindukush tracts lying between ancient Bactria in the north-west and Kashmir on the south-east have naturally a special fascination for me. Our information about their geography, historical as well as physical, has much expanded since Sir Henry Yule, the great elucidator of early Asiatic travel, wrote his comments on these chapters of Ser Marco's immortal book. The results of this fresh inquiry, limited as its scope is, bring out once again the remarkable care of the great traveller's record even where it relates to ground beyond his personal observation. They may hence be presented here as a modest contribution towards the supplementary volume Prof. Henri Cordier's indefatigable hand is preparing to his, the third, edition of Sir Henry Yule's *magnum opus*.

Marco Polo first takes us to that interesting region between the Oxus and Indus where in connection with his Persian travels he records an incidental account of the devastations carried on in his times by the *Caraonas*, predatory bands of Mongols and their half-breed descendants (see Yule, 'The Book of Ser Marco Polo,' 3rd edit., revised by H. Cordier, 1, p. 98). "The king of these scoundrels is called *Nogodar*. This Nogodar had gone to the court of Chagatai, who was own brother to the Great Kaan, with some 10,000 horsemen of his, and abode with him; for Chagatai was his uncle. And whilst there this Nogodar devised a most audacious enterprise, and I will tell you what it was. He left his uncle, who was then in Greater Armenia, and fled with a great body of horsemen, cruel unscrupulous fellows, first through *Badashan*, and then through another province called *Pashai-Dir*, and then through another called *Ariora-Keshemur*. There he lost a great number of his people and of his horses, for the roads were very narrow and perilous. And when he had conquered all those provinces, he entered India at the extremity of a province called *Dalivar*. He established himself in that city and government, which he took from the king of the country, *Asedin Soldan* by name, a man of great power and wealth. And there abideth Nogodar with his army, afraid of nobody, and waging war with all the Tartars in his neighbourhood."

With the historical data bearing on this remarkable exploit we need not concern ourselves here in detail. Sir Henry Yule in his notes has examined them at length from such sources as were accessible to him in

translations or extracts, and has shown that Muhammadan records both of Persia and India know of Mongol inroads during the latter half of the thirteenth century which carried large bands of freebooters under a leader called *Nogodar* into the borderlands of Iran and India and even as far as Lahore (see Yule, *ibid.*, pp. 102 *sqq.*). These inroads appear to have commenced from about 1260 A.D., and to have continued right through the reign of Ghiasuddin, Sultan of Delhi (1266-86), whose identity with Marco's *Asedin Soldan* is certain. It appears very probable that Marco's story of Nogodar, the nephew of Chagatai, relates to one of the earliest of these incursions which was recent history when the Poli passed through Persia about 1272-73 A.D. There seems reason to hope that a critical examination of the available original sources may yet allow the chronology and historical circumstances of the expedition related by Marco to be determined with greater accuracy, and that this may clear up certain doubts and discrepancies duly noted by Sir Henry Yule in the records he had access to. But what alone concerns us here is to trace the route taken by Nogodar's host, and to identify the localities which Marco's account names along it.

Our task is much facilitated by the fact that the territories indicated by the first and by the last two names in Marco's topographical list can be fixed with certainty, as recognized by Yule and partly by earlier commentators also. There is no doubt that by *Badashan* is meant Badakhshan, the province north of the Hindukush, through which the Venetian passed on his way to the upper Oxus, and which he quite correctly describes in a subsequent chapter (see Yule, 'Marco Polo,' I, pp. 157 *sqq.*). It is equally certain that Marco's *Keshemur* is Kashmir, of which he gives a very interesting and remarkably correct account before continuing to describe his own route from Badakhshan towards the Pamirs and beyond (see Yule, 'Marco Polo,' I, pp. 166 *sq.*). *Dalivar*, also spelt *Dilivar*, the last name, had been, indeed, the subject of varying conjectures until Sir Henry Yule's sure critical sense led him to recognize the definite proof which the notice of a Muhammadan chronicler of India, relating the capture of Lahore by Mongol raiders in Ghiasuddin's time, furnishes that "Marsden was right, and that *Dilivar* is really a misunderstanding of 'Città di Livar' for *Lahawar* or Lahore."

From Badakhshan to Kashmir it is a far cry, and though much of the intervening ground is rendered difficult by high ranges and deep-cut river gorges—the latter in the Hindukush, as in other alpine regions, often even more formidable obstacles than the passes—a variety of possible routes might come into consideration. As to which was the route which Ser Marco heard of as having witnessed Nogodar's daring exploit, no definite evidence has so far been available. Of the several localities which his account interposes between Badakhshan and Kashmir there is only one which as yet could be clearly placed on the map of this mountain region as we know it: I mean the second part of the copulate name *Pashai-Dir*.

In this Sir Henry Yule and before him Pauthier rightly recognized the present *Dir*, the mountain tract at the head of the western branch of the Panjkora River, through which leads the most frequented route from Peshawar and the lower Swat valley to Chitral.* As regards the location of *Pashai*, Sir Henry Yule encountered considerable difficulty, illuminating though his comments are, and no wonder; for limited was the information then available about the geography of a region which even now in parts is still practically unsurveyed. *Ariora* has remained altogether unexplained; for what conjectures regarding this name Sir Henry Yule thought worth mentioning—with due caution, I may add—are such as would not stand serious examination by critical students familiar with the historical topography of the Indian North-West Frontier, and with methods of scientific philological research.†

Taking the name *Pashai* first, the difficulty it raises must claim all the more attention because Marco Polo in another place, immediately after describing Badakhshan, devotes a separate little chapter to the 'Province of Pashai.' It may be well to quote it in full, though I do not propose here to discuss every detail it records (see Yule, 'Marco Polo,' I, p. 164). "You must know that ten days' journey to the south of Badashan there is a Province called *Pashai*, the people of which have a peculiar language, and are Idolaters, of a brown complexion. They are great adepts in sorceries and the diabolic arts. The men wear earrings and brooches of gold and silver set with stones and pearls. They are a pestilent people and a crafty; and they live upon flesh and rice. Their country is very hot.

"Now let us proceed and speak of another country which is seven days' journey from this one towards the south-east, and the name of which is *Keshimur*."

It is clear that a safe identification of the territory intended cannot be based upon such characteristics of its people as Marco Polo's account here notes (obviously from hearsay), but must reckon in the first place with the plainly stated bearing and distance. And Sir Henry Yule's difficulty arose just from the fact that what the information accessible to him seemed to show about the location of the name *Pashai* could not be satisfactorily reconciled with those plain topographical data. Marco's great commentator, thoroughly familiar as he was with whatever was known in his time about the geography of the western Hindukush and

* See Yule, *ibid.*, I, p. 104. *Dir* has played its part in the events connected with the Chitral campaign of 1895, and gives now its name to a Pathan chiefship comprising most of the Panjkora and Swat River headwaters. For a brief account of the main valley, cf., e.g., my 'Desert Cathay,' I, pp. 18 *sqq.*

† See Yule, 'Marco Polo,' I, p. 104, where one solution suggested is that *Ariora* may be "some corrupt or Mongol form of *Aryavartta*," an ancient Sanskrit designation of the whole of India! The other, offered on General Cunningham's authority, that *Ariora* may be the Sanskrit *Harhaura*, an alleged early name of the Western Panjab, is quite as fanciful.

the regions between Oxus and Indus,* could not fail to recognize the obvious connection between our *Pashai* and the tribal name *Pashai* borne by Muhammadanized Kafirs who are repeatedly mentioned in medieval and modern accounts of Kabul territory.† But all these accounts seemed to place the Pashais in the vicinity of the great Panjshir valley, north-east of Kabul, through which passes one of the best known routes from the Afghan capital to the Hindukush watershed and thence to the Middle Oxus.‡ Panjshir, like Kabul itself, lies to the *south-west* of Badakhshan, and it is just this discrepancy of bearing together with one in the distance reckoned to Kashmir which caused Sir Henry Yule to give expression to doubts when summing up his views about Nogodar's route.§

The valleys descending to the south from the Hindukush main range between Panjshir in the west and Chitral in the east are inhabited by Kafir tribes, now all subject to Afghan rule. They remain to the present day as inaccessible to European exploration as they were when Sir Henry Yule wrote. What knowledge we now have of their topography, apart from some high peaks triangulated over great distances, is still mainly derived from native route reports and the like. But fortunately for the question in which we are interested, important help is offered by the results of the great Linguistic Survey of India which Sir George Grierson has carried on under the orders of the Indian Government, and which for its vast scope and methodical thoroughness will for ever rank

* Among the writings of Sir Henry Yule which bear eloquent testimony to his familiarity with these regions and their historical past, it may suffice to mention his masterly "Essay on the Geography of the Valley of the Oxus," prefixed to the new edition (1872) of Captain John Wood's classic, 'A Journey to the Source of the River Oxus' (pp. xxi.-civ.). It still remains to this day a mine of valuable information, in spite of all later additions to our knowledge of Central-Asian geography and history.

† For such references to the Pashais, mostly recorded by travellers who followed the great route across the Hindukush north-east of Kabul, see Yule, 'Marco Polo,' I, p. 165. Their list extends from Ibn Batuta to officers whom the first British occupation of Kabul in 1839-40 brought to these parts.

‡ For handy reference on topographical points concerning the Hindukush region between Kabul and Chitral-Dir and discussed in these pages may be recommended the *Afghanistan Sheet* of the Survey of India's 'Southern Asia Series,' 1 : 2,000,000, also sheets Nos. 38, 43 of 'India and Adjacent Countries,' 1 : 1,000,000 (published under the direction of Colonel Sir S. G. Burrard, Surveyor-General in India, 1914-17). They embody, within the limitations imposed by the small scale, results of recent surveys not otherwise readily accessible to the student.

§ Cf. 'Marco Polo,' i. p. 165, last para. of note: "The route of which Marco had heard must almost certainly have been one of those leading by the high Valley of Zebak, and by the Dorah or Nuksan Pass, over the watershed of Hindu-Kush into Chitral, and so to Dir, as already noticed. The difficulty remains as to how he came to apply the name *Pashai* to the country south-east of Badakhshan. I cannot tell. But it is at least possible that the name of the Pashai tribe (of which the branches even now are spread over a considerable extent of country) may have once had a wide application over the southern spurs of the Hindu-Kush. Our Author, moreover, is speaking here from hearsay, and hearsay geography without maps is much given to generalizing. . . ."

among the chief glories of scientific enterprise due to British administration in India. The carefully collected materials of the Linguistic Survey cover ground far beyond the administrative limits of the Indian Empire, and on its north-west frontier in particular comprise the many languages spoken on both sides of the Hindukush. Sir George Grierson's Survey has established the important fact that to the south of the range the languages spoken from Kashmir in the east to Kafiristan in the west are neither of Indian nor of Iranian origin, but form a third branch of the Aryan stock of the great Indo-European language family.*

Among the languages of this branch now rightly designated as "Dardic," the Kafir group holds a very prominent place. In the Kafir group again we find the *Pashai* language spoken over a very considerable area. The map accompanying Sir George Grierson's monograph on 'The Pis'āca Languages of North-Western India,' † shows *Pashai* as the language spoken along the right bank of the Kunar river as far as the Asmar tract as well as in the side valleys which from the north descend towards it and the Kabul river further west. This important fact makes it certain that the tribal designation of Pashai to which this Kafir language owes its name, has to this day an application extending much further east than was indicated by the references which travellers, mediæval and modern, along the Panjshir route have made to the Pashais and from which alone this ethnic name was previously known.

Thus Sir Henry Yule's cautiously voiced suggestion that "the name of the Pashai tribe . . . may have once had a wide application over the southern spurs of the Hindu-Kush" has proved right. With the location of the Pashais extended to the south-east as far as the Kunar river and the tracts immediately adjoining Dir from the west, it becomes easy for us to account both for the bearing and distance which Marco indicates for the "Province of Pashai," and for the description he gives of its people. A look at the map shows that the Kunar Valley from Asmar to Jalalabad lies exactly south of that central portion of Badakhshan which contains the old capital of the territory marked by the present Khairabad and Baharak as well as the fertile tract of Jirm. Proceeding due south of Baharak and Jirm by the valley of the Kokcha the Kunar can con-

* For the main facts concerning the "Dardic" languages found now south of the Hindukush, and once spoken also along the Indus Valley much further away to the south, see Sir George Grierson's paper in the *Journal of the R. Asiatic Society*, 1900, pp. 501 sqq. ; also his monograph 'The Pis'āca Languages of North-Western India' (*Asiatic Society Monographs*, VIII, 1906), pp. 4 sqq.

† See the preceding note. More exact details about the local distribution of the Pashai tribes will, no doubt, become available when the last volume of Sir G. Grierson's monumental work dealing with this language branch is published, along with its illustrative maps.

[Since this paper was sent to press Sir George Grierson has kindly pointed out to me that Gawar-bati, the Kafir language round the confluence of the Bashgal and Kunar (Chitral) rivers, is very closely connected with Pashai, and that "quite possibly in the thirteenth century Gawar-bati and Pashai formed one language spoken by one people."]

veniently be reached across either the Mandal or the Kamarbida Pass by ten marches, the total marching distance as roughly calculated from the map probably not exceeding 180 miles by either route. We shall presently see that it was in all probability the former and somewhat shorter route across the Mandal Pass to which Marco Polo's information gathered in connection with Nogodar's incursion refers.

His description of the Pashai people as "Idolaters, of a brown complexion," "a pestilent people and crafty," is just such as he might have heard applied to the heathen Kafirs by their Badakhshan neighbours in the north, already good Muhammadans at the time of his passage. The reference to the Pashai people's diet, on flesh and rice, and to their country being hot, well fits the tracts on the Kunar and the lower portions of the Kafir valleys where they debouch on that river. The mention of their being "great adepts in sorceries and the diabolic arts" is, as Yule has already pointed out, in full accord with what the great Chinese pilgrim Hsüan-tsang tells us of the old inhabitants of Swat, the large territory immediately to the east of the Kunar Valley, whose connection in language and ethnic origin with the Kafirs and Dards recent research clearly indicates.*

We may now return to what Marco tells us of the route which Nogodar with his host of Mongol freebooters followed on his great raid from Badakhshan to Kashmir. In the light of the explanations now furnished as regards the location of Pashai, and having regard to the direction indicated by the mention of Dir and to what the map plainly shows, I believe it may be considered as certain that the Mongols' route led across the Mandal Pass into the great Kafir valley of Bashgal and thus down to Arnawai on the Kunar. Thence Dir could be gained directly across the Zakhanna Pass, a single day's march. There were alternative routes, too, available to the same destination either by ascending the Kunar to Ashreth and taking the present "Chitral Road" across the Lowarai,† or descending the river to Asmar and crossing the Binshi Pass.

That the route here indicated is by far the most direct for those wishing from the Badakhshan side to gain Kashmir *viâ* Dir is evident on a look at the map.‡ That the Mandal Pass, estimated there at 15,200

* See Watters, 'On Yuan Chwang's Travels,' 1, p. 225. At the time of Hsüan-tsang's visit, *circa* 631 A.D., the people of Swat (Udyana) were Buddhists. Muhammadanism, propagated by Pathan conquest, did not penetrate into Swat and the Kunar Valley until well after Marco Polo's time; in some of the less accessible mountain tracts towards Chitral and Gilgit it was fully established only in relatively modern days.

† For a description of the Lowarai Pass and its approaches, see my 'Desert Cathay,' 1, pp. 21 *sqq.*

‡ It is the map, too, which conclusively demonstrates that the route which Sir Henry Yule assumed to have been followed on Nogodar's inroad, through the Zebak Valley and by the Dorah or the Nuksan Pass into Chitral and so to Dir, would have meant a very great detour. The extremely confined nature of the Chitral gorges, and

feet, is practicable for laden animals during the summer and autumn, probably under conditions like those of the neighbouring and better-known Dorah Pass, leading to Chitral, may be safely concluded from the remarks of Sir George Robertson, who on his adventurous visit to Kafiristan ascended the Bashgal Valley to its head in 1892 (cf. Robertson, 'The Kafirs of the Hindu-kush,' p. 305). Even then a good deal of trade made its way thither from the Badakhshan side, and this may have undoubtedly increased since Afghan rule some years later was extended also over this portion of Kafiristan and the last independent Kafir tribes were reduced. It is interesting to find the route leading up the Bashgal Valley to the Mandal Pass quite accurately described already in the 'Surveys' of Moghul Beg, dating back to about 1789-90, from which the late Major Raverty has made extensive extracts accessible in his 'Notes on Afghanistan.'*

Here it may be convenient to note also that, as I have had occasion to show elsewhere, the route followed in 519 A.D. by the Chinese Buddhist pilgrim Sung Yün from Badakhshan *viâ* Zebak into the territory of *Shê-mi*, *i.e.* Kafiristan, must have led over the Mandal Pass (see Stein, 'Ancient Khotan,' 1, p. 14; also 'Serindia,' 1, pp. 9 *sqq.*). After reaching this territory, the description of which closely fits the Kunar Valley or Marco's Pashai, the pious traveller proceeded straight south to Udyana or Swat.

It still remains for us to trace the route by which Nogodar's host is likely to have made its way from "Pashai-Dir" to Kashmir. Here we are fortunately on ground which, in consequence of a succession of frontier expeditions, including the Chitral campaign of 1895 and those following the great tribal rising in Swat, etc., two years later, has seen a considerable amount of exact survey work, covering practically the whole of the area we have to consider here.† My journey to Chitral in 1906 and numerous preceding archæological tours, including the one made in 1898 with the Buner Field Force, and that which in 1904 brought me to a tract of independent tribal territory round Mount Mahaban not previously visited by any European,‡ allow me to speak from personal knowledge the sterile nature of most of the ground would besides have made such a route practically impossible for a large body of *horsemen*. These objections could, of course, not be fully realized from such data as were available at the time when Sir Henry Yule wrote.

* The record of these surveys executed by Moghul Beg on behalf of Colonel Polier, of Benares, contains so much exact information still of interest for the geography, history, and ethnography of the Indian North-West Frontier, that its translation *in extenso* from the two Persian MSS. of it available in the India Office Library would appear very desirable. Moghul Beg, a native of Kabul, seems to have been a man possessed of excellent topographical sense. His powers of accurate observation and faithful record in general were certainly exceptional in a man of his origin and *milieu*.

† Convenient reference for this area may be made to Sheets No. 38, 43 of the Survey of India's 1:1,000,000 Map; also to its 'Map of the Panjab, North-West Frontier Province and Kashmir,' 16 miles to 1 inch.

‡ Cf. for these tours, *e.g.*, 'Detailed Report on an Archæological Tour with the Buner Field Force,' Lahore, 1898; 'Report of Archæological Survey Work in the

of almost the whole of the line along which, I believe, the route meant by Marco Polo may be traced.

A look at the map shows that for a large body of horsemen wishing to make their way from Dir towards Kashmir the easiest and in matter of time nearest route must have led then, as now, down the Panjkora Valley and beyond through the open tracts of Lower Swat and Buner to the Indus about Amb. From there it was easy through the open northern part of the present Hazara District (the ancient Urasa) to gain the valley of the Jhelam River at its sharp bend near Muzaffarabad. Through all periods of history the line of the Jhelam from above this point has served as the only practicable route for trade or invasion leading up to the great valley of Kashmir proper.* The line just indicated from Dir to the Indus lies almost everywhere through wide fertile valleys, and the passes of Katgala and Mora-Bazdarra, by which the watersheds separating the drainage areas of the Panjkora, Swat and Buner rivers have to be crossed, are quite easy, with elevations well below 4000 feet.†

But it is not merely the configuration of the ground which supplies strong reasons for tracing Nogodar's route along the line I have briefly sketched. I think striking confirmation for it is furnished also by the name *Ariora*, which the itinerary as recorded by Marco interposes between Dir and Kashmir, and which has so far remained unexplained and puzzling. I believe we may in it safely recognize the present *Agror*, the well-known name of the hill tract on the Hazara border which faces Buner on the east from across the left bank of the Indus. The hills of Agror form a southern offshoot of the Black Mountains, and through them lead a number of easy routes connecting the Indus valley below the debouchure of the Barandu or Buner River with the fertile plains of northern Hazara and with the Jhelam valley.

Long ago, when commenting upon a passage of Kalhana's Sanskrit 'Chronicle of Kashmir,' I had occasion to prove in detail that the modern form *Agror* must be connected with the Sanskrit *Atyugrapura*, the name by which Kalhana mentions this hill tract, "strong in fighting men" (just as it has remained to the present day), in connection with a contem-

North-West Frontier Province' (Peshawar, 1905), pp. 19 *sqq.*; also 'Desert Cathay,' 1, pp. 13 *sqq.*

* For the history of the route along the Jhelam River (*Vitasta* in Sanskrit, the classical *Hydaspes*), see my "Memoir on the Ancient Geography of Kashmir" in Stein, 'Kalhana's Rajatarangini' (transl., 1900), 2, pp. 401 *sqq.*

† To any one familiar with the topography of this area between Kunar and Indus it seems scarcely necessary to explain that any other line taken further north and across Upper Swat, though shorter on the map, would have carried Nogodar's force across a succession of much higher passes and over far more difficult ground. An objection, even more serious perhaps, to such an attempt at a "short cut" would be presented by the very confined nature of the Indus Valley higher up, and the great obstacle presented to the east of it by the high and very rugged range of the Black Mountains.

porary expedition (A.D. 1149-50) to Urasa or Hazara.* This is not the place to discuss the exact details of the phonetic change which has led to the present form of the name and which may help also to account for Marco's *Ariora*. In any case it is certain that the name of the tract actually in use in Kalhana's time, and more than a century later when Nogodar's inroad took place, could not have been the archaic one of Sanskrit *Atyugrapura*, but must have more closely approached the modern form *Agror*. Whether *Ariora* is the only reading for this local name among the many manuscripts of Marco Polo's text and whether the divergence it shows from the modern form of the name is to be accounted for on phonetic grounds, palæographically or otherwise, are points which I must leave to others more competent in such matters to determine.†

The identification of *Ariora* = *Agror* thus presents itself as a conclusive argument in favour of Nogodar's track having lain through the Bashgal Valley, Dir, Swat, Buner, Agror, and up the Jhelam Valley—the line which at the present day, too, would be the most direct and practicable for a mobile column of horsemen forcing its way from Badakhshan to Kashmir. But this identification is of additional value because it helps to explain and justify what Marco Polo tells us about the relative position of Pashai and Kashmir. In his above-quoted chapter on Pashai he speaks of "Keshimur" as a country being "seven days' journey from this one (*i.e.* Pashai) towards the south-east," and the shortness of this estimate has perplexed Sir Henry Yule, strong as his belief in Marco's general accuracy justly was (see 'Marco Polo,' I, p. 166, topmost paras.).

But if we take due account of the topography of the route above

* See my translation of 'Kalhana's Rajatarangini,' 2, p. 267, note on 8, 3402. There I have also pointed out that we have an early rendering of the original Sanskrit form of the name in 'Ἰθάγυρος mentioned by Ptolemy, 'Geography,' vii. I, 45, besides Taxila as one of the "cities" in the Ἀρσα or Οὐδάρσα territory. The latter has long ago been identified with *Urasa*, or *Hazara*, and *Taxiala* with the city of *Taksasila* or *Taxila*, famous both in early Indian literature and in Greek records of ancient India. Its site, at the southern border of the Hazara District, is marked by extensive remains near *Sarai-kala*, which are now being systematically excavated by the Indian Archæological Survey under Sir John Marshall. The identification of 'Ἰθάγυρος with *Atyugrapura* : *Agror* is strongly supported by the position which Ptolemy assigns to this locality relative to *Taxiala* : *Taxila*. The form 'Ἰθάγυρος is easily accounted for on philological grounds as an attempt to render an earlier Prakrit form of the name.

† [Since this paper was written Sir George Grierson has favoured me with a very valuable note on the phonetic relationship between *Atyugrapura* : *Agror* : *Ariora*. He does not dispute the identity of *Atyugrapura* with *Agror*, but expresses doubts as to the existence of an intermediate Prakrit form **Ayugraura*, as conjecturally assumed by me in my note on the "Rajatarangini" passage above quoted. He adds, however, the important observation that under a well-established phonetic rule of the Dardic languages (*cf.* his "Pis'āca Languages," pp. 105 *sqq.*) **Atugraura* might be a Dardic form of the name *Atyugrapura*. In Khowar, the Dardic language of Chitral, "medial *t* regularly becomes *r*, so that this would give us **Arugyaaura*, which is not far from *Ariora*. It is quite possible that the Khowar pronunciation would be that heard in Badakhshan." This suggestion well deserves consideration in view of the close historical connection between Chitral and Badakhshan.]

indicated and also of what the Kashmir Chronicle shows us about the political dependence of Urasa-Hazara, of which Agror forms part, it is easy to explain Marco's statement. A look at the map makes it clear that the whole of Kashmir lies, just as we are told there, to the south-east of Pashai, assuming that the bearing is taken from where the Bashgal Valley debouches on the Kunar. And it must be borne in mind that, as Yule rightly recognized, Marco Polo is merely reproducing information derived from a Mongol source and based on Nogodar's exploit. Now starting from a point like Arnawai, where the route down the Bashgal Valley strikes the Kunar river, and which certainly is well within Pashai, lightly equipped horsemen could by that route easily reach the border of Agror on the Indus within seven days. Speaking from personal knowledge of most of the ground, I should be prepared to do the ride myself by the following approximate stages: Dir, Warai, Sado, Chakdara, Kinkargalal, Bajkatta, Kai or Darband on the Indus.*

Once arrived in Agror, Nogodar and his Mongols might well claim to have reached the political, though not the geographical, border of Kashmir; for the northern portion of Hazara and the valley of the Jhelam may safely be assumed to have then been still dependent on the Kashmir kingdom, as they certainly were in Kalhana's time only a century earlier and already on Hsüan-tsang's visit, five centuries before.† But in reality the serious obstacles to the invasion of Kashmir proper still lay before the Mongols, even when they had forced their way through Agror and Hazara. The narrow, tortuous gorges through which the Jhelam River or Vitasta cuts its way from below the 'Gate' of Baramula (Varahamula) and the precipitous rugged spurs rising above them have served through all periods of history as the strongest natural defences of Kashmir against invasion from the west. In my 'Memoir on the Ancient Geography of Kashmir' I have had ample occasion to discuss them, and there is hence no need here to give details (see Stein, 'Rajatarangini,' 2, pp. 401 *sqq.*).

But it is of interest to note how clearly also this feature of the ground across which Nogodar's force effected its "most audacious enterprise," is reflected in Marco Polo's record. It is immediately after his mention of "Ariora-Keshimur" that he tells us: "There he lost a great number of his people and of his horses; for the roads were very narrow and perilous." How serious the barriers are which nature has raised in the defiles of the Jhelam Valley against any invader, must be obvious to whoever has

* During a great portion of the year it would be easy to save the stage at Sado by crossing the Laram Pass and thus cutting off the big detour down the Panjkora and through Talash.

† Cf. for the history of Urasa or Hazara, Stein, 'Rajatarangini,' I, pp. 215 *sq.*, note on v. 217. The whole hill tract between Indus and Kashmir proper was known in Muhammadan times by the name of *Pakhli*. It deserves to be noted that the northern portions of the tract continued to be governed from Kashmir during the relatively modern period of Pathan and Sikh rule.

followed this route by the cart road now giving access to Kashmir, a triumph of modern engineering. It is equally easy to realize them on reading of this "road before it was made" in the accounts of early European travellers, like Moorcraft, Vigne, Baron Hügel, etc. In Marco Polo's special reference to the difficulties here encountered on roads "very narrow and perilous," we have further striking evidence that the account he has left us of Nogodar's great venture was derived from a trustworthy Mongol source and reproduced with remarkable faithfulness.

This cannot be the place for an attempt to trace a record of Nogodar's transient conquest of Kashmir in the later Chronicles of the Valley still awaiting critical edition and elucidation. Nor need I do more here than allude to the curious parallel presented by the equally hardy raid which, effected from the opposite direction across the high ranges of the Kun-lun and the inhospitable plateaux of the Kara-koram, carried Mirza Haidar Dughlat, a distant kinsman of Nogodar, into Kashmir two and a half centuries later, and made that cultured Moghul prince for a time master of the mountain-girt kingdom (see Mirza Haidar's 'Tarikh-i-Rashidi,' ed. and transl. by Elias and Ross, pp. 423 *sqq.*).

One concluding remark bearing on the value of Marco Polo's own record will suffice. We have seen how accurately it reproduces information about territories difficult of access at all times, and far away from his own route. It appears to me quite impossible to believe that such exact data learned at the very beginning of the great traveller's long wanderings could have been reproduced by him from memory alone close on thirty years later, when dictating his wonderful story to Rusticiano during his captivity at Genoa. Here, anyhow, we have definite proof of the use of those "notes and memoranda which he had brought with him," and which, as Ramusio's 'Preface' of 1553 tells us (see Yule, 'Marco Polo,' I, Introduction, p. 6), Messer Marco while prisoner of war was believed to have had sent to him by his father from Venice. How grateful must geographer and historical student alike feel that these precious materials reached the illustrious prisoner safely!

BOUNDARY DELIMITATIONS IN THE TREATY OF VERSAILLES

BY provisions in the Treaty of Peace signed with Germany at Versailles on 28 June 1919, several Commissions are to take the field within fifteen days of the Treaty coming into force to demarcate those boundaries delimited in the Treaty which are not old administrative boundaries already well marked. The technique of the boundary delimitation is, therefore, of immediate interest.

The Treaty of Peace between the Allied and Associated Powers and Germany, published as Treaty Series No. 4 (1919), is furnished with four